Biointerface Research in Applied Chemistry

www.BiointerfaceResearch.com

Original Research Article

Open Access Journal

ISSN 2069-5837

Received: 29.04.2018 / Revised: 05.06.2018 / Accepted: 10.06.2018 / Published on-line: 15.06.2018

Assessing the toxicity of silver nanoparticles in cell suspension culture of *Nicotiana tabacum*

Sepideh Mahjouri¹, Ali Movafeghi^{1,*}, Baharak Divband^{2,3}, Morteza Kosari-Nasab⁴, Elham Mohajel Kazemi¹

¹ Department of Plant Biology, Faculty of Natural Sciences, University of Tabriz, Tabriz, Iran

² Infectious and Tropical Diseases Research Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran

³ Stem Cell Research Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran

⁴ Drug Applied Research Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran

*corresponding author e-mail address: movafeghi@tabrizu.ac.ir

ABSTRACT

Silver nanoparticles (Ag NPs) are one of the commercialized nanomaterials that are involved in quite a lot of industrial and biomedical utilization. Although some efforts have been made to examine the possible toxicity of Ag NPs on plant systems, but no consensus has been reached on this issue. To determine the effect of Ag NPs on antioxidant defense system in cell suspension cultures of *Nicotiana tabacum*, we evaluated the changes in multiple biomarkers of oxidative stress. Ag NPs were synthesized using photo reduction method and characterized as NPs with spherical shape and diameters in the range of 10-100 nm by means of XRD, DLS, and SEM techniques. A significant decline in the cell growth and viability even at low concentration of Ag NPs (5 mg L⁻¹) were evident. Interestingly, a progressive decline in hydrogen peroxide levels was observed, while the contents of malondialdehyde did not change. The activity of ROS scavenging enzymes augmented with the increasing concentration of Ag NPs. Additionally, the contents of phenolic and flavonoid contents were reduced after exposure of the cells to higher concentrations (15, 20, and 25 mg L⁻¹) of Ag NPs. These findings confirmed that Ag NPs triggered oxidative stress in cell suspension culture of *N. tabacum*.

Keywords: Silver nanoparticles; Nicotiana tabacum; cell suspension cultures; antioxidant defense.

1. INTRODUCTION

Silver nanoparticles (Ag NPs) are one of the commercialized nanomaterials that are involved in several industrial and biomedical applications. Due to their special properties of silver and nano size, they have been used in many personal care products, food services, optical sensors, medical instruments, textiles, drug delivery systems, and as anticancer agents [1, 2]. They also possess excellent antimicrobial and anti-inflammatory activities that make them promising agents for potential biomedical applications [3, 4]. Therefore, a number of physical, chemical, and biological techniques have been employed for the synthesis of Ag NPs [5, 6].

The disadvantage of Ag NPs is the induced toxicity in biological systems at different degrees. A number of studies have been shown that Ag NPs can cause adverse effects on humans as well as the environment [7, 8]. Since plants are the basic components of ecosystems, the phytotoxic effects of Ag NPs should be given particular emphasis in toxicological studies. Heretofore, a number of plant-based experimental systems have been used to evaluate the impacts of Ag NPs on plants. Studies on the growth of plants in hydroponic media revealed the phytotoxicity of Ag NPs and confirmed their uptake, translocation, and accumulation in different organs [9-12]. In addition, solid growth matrices have been utilized in Ag toxicity studies [13]. For example, investigation on the impact of commercial Ag NPs on Triticum aestivum in sand indicated the translocation of Ag from exposed roots into shoots [14]. Nano forms of Ag also significantly inhibited the development of Capsicum annuum grown in a commercial substrate [15]. There are some evidence showing the significant impact of the utilized medium for toxicological studies on phytotoxicity of Ag NPs. Assessment of the effects of silver ions dissolved from Ag NPs on crop plant species indicated that they were less toxic in soil than agar solidified media [16]. Beside the whole-plant trials, *in vitro* plant cell and tissue cultures have been exploited in different studies intended for recognizing the interaction of plant cells with a wild variety of organic and heavy metal pollutants [17, 18] as well as NPs [19, 20]. Practical convenience and technical advantages of these methods, including eliminating the effects of microflora and translocation barriers, make them useful experimental models for toxicity and tolerance studies [21].

Although Ag NPs provide many benefits, various aspects of their toxicity have remained unknown. Hence, further toxicological investigations seem be substantial to for understanding the association of the physicochemical properties of Ag NPs with their toxicity. The current study was designed to evaluate the toxicity of Ag NPs in cell suspension cultures of Nicotiana tabacum, as a model system for the research of NPs stresses [22-24]. So far, no previous research has examined the toxic impacts of Ag NPs on tobacco cells despite the fact that these cell cultures are used extensively in plant science. In the current study, we considered some factors such as growth and cell viability; ROS level; superoxide dismutase (SOD, EC 1.15.1.1) as well as peroxidase (POD EC 1.11.1.7) activity; and content of MDA, total phenols and flavonoids to conclude whether Ag NPs can induce oxidative stress in tobacco cell cultures.

2. EXPERIMENTAL SECTION

2.1. Synthesis and characterization of Ag NPs. In order to the synthesis of Ag NPs by using photo reduction method, 1.6 g of polyethylene glycol (2000) was dissolved in 20 ml of ethanol (96%) and then added to the AgNO₃ solution (0.4 g in 5 ml of deionized water). The solution was refluxed for 3 h. The mixture was stirred for 2 h under UV-C (30W) lamp to reduce Ag⁺ to Ag nanoparticles. The precipitate was separated from the solution by centrifugation at 8000 g for 5 min, washed with deionized water repeatedly to remove the residual Ag⁺ and then placed in an autoclave at 121 °C for 20 minutes.

The synthesized Ag NPs were characterized using field emission scanning electron microscope (FESEM) (CamScan mv2300), X-ray powder diffraction (XRD) (ADVANCE D8, Bruker, Germany), and dynamic light scattering (DLS) (Zetasizer Nano-ZS, Malvern Instruments, UK) techniques.

2.2. Preparing tobacco cell suspension cultures. Cell suspension cultures were obtained from three-month-old calli, (initiated from cotyledon explants of 3-week-old seedlings of *N. tabacum* cv. Virginia). The cells were cultured in the Murashige and Skoog (MS) medium supplemented with 2 % sucrose and 1 mg L⁻¹ of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid. The cells were subcultured once a week and maintained under constant shaking (110 rpm) at 25 °C in the dark. For the Ag NPs toxicity analysis, the experiments were conducted in the exponential phase of growth (4-day-old cell culture). The cells were exposed to different concentrations of Ag NPs (0, 5, 10, 15, 20, and 25 mg L⁻¹) and were harvested after 48 hours (h) of incubation for different assays. Dry weight of the samples was measured after drying in an oven at 50 °C for 24 h and was expressed as mg per flask, where the total concentration of cultures was 10 ml.

2.3. TTC assay. Cell viability was assessed using triphenyltetrazolium chloride (TTC) assay [25]. Percentage of cell viability was calculated according to the optical density (OD) at 485 nm (SPEKOL 1500 UV-VIS spectrophotometer) of treated tobacco cells with Ag NPs compared with control.

2.4. Microscopic observations. Neutral red (NR) staining was performed according to method reported by Kariya et al. [26] in order to determine the cytotoxicity in the cells. Moreover, the effect of Ag NPs on tobacco cells apoptosis were determined

3. RESULTS SECTION

3.1. Characteristics of Ag NPs. Synthesized Ag NPs was characterized using different techniques. Based on SEM analysis, the shape of synthesized Ag NPs were determined as spherical with diameters ranging of 10-100 nm (Figure 1). The XRD pattern confirmed the crystalline nature of synthesized Ag NPs (Figure 2). XRD peaks at 20 of 38.22° , 44.38° , 64.48° , and 77.38° could be attributed to the 111, 200, 220, and 311 crystallographic planes of face centered cubic crystal structure of Ag [34]. The size distribution profile of NPs in suspension as well as zeta potential were determined by DLS as 22.95 nm and -15.4 mV, respectively (Figure 3 a, b). The negative value confirms the high disparity and stability of Ag NPs [35]. According to these results the

morphologically by staining with 5 μ g ml⁻¹ acridine orange (AO), for 30 min at the dark and fluorescence microscopy (Novel N800-F).

2.5. Evaluation the content of hydrogen peroxide. Assessing the hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) levels was done based on the method reported by Velikova et al. [27]. The absorbance of the experiments was read at 390 nm and H_2O_2 concentration was calculated using a standard curve and expressed as μ mol g⁻¹ FW.

2.6. MDA assay. For the determination of lipid peroxidation, malondialdehyde (MDA) content was measured [28]. The absorbance of the reaction mixture was detected at 532 nm and the MDA concentration was quantified based on 3, 1, 1, 3-tetraethoxy propane (0-100 nM) standard curve and expressed as nmol g⁻¹ FW.

2.7. Total protein content and antioxidant enzyme activity. An amount of 0.2 g of fresh tobacco cells was homogenized in prechilled mortar and pestle with 1 mL of 50 mM potassium phosphate buffer (pH 7). The homogenate was centrifuged at 10,000 g at 4 °C for 20 min. The resulting supernatant was used to measure the antioxidant enzyme activities. Total SOD activity was measured according to the method described by Winterbourn et al. [29]. The quantity of enzyme required for the inhibition of 50% of nitro blue tetrazolium chloride reduction was defined as one unit of SOD activity. Total POD activity was quantified by the technique reported by Chance and Maehly [30]. POD activity was considered as the enzyme amount capable of converting 1 µmol guaiacol to tetraguaiacol per minute per ml. The content of total soluble protein was calculated using Bradford method [31] and expressed as mg g⁻¹ FW.

2.8. Total phenolic and flavonoid contents. Phenolic and flavonoid contents, extracted with methanol (0.3 g tobacco cells per 1 mL), was quantified using the Folin-Ciocalteu method [32] with gallic acid as the standard and the method of Quitter-Deleu et al. [33] with quercetin as the standard, respectively. Their quantities were expressed as $\mu g g^{-1}$ FW.

2.9. Statistical analysis. The data were subjected to one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA; SPSS 22 for Windows) followed by Duncan's test ($P \le 0.05$). The measurements were conducted in triplets and the obtained results were expressed as the mean \pm SD.

characteristics of the synthesized Ag NPs seemed to be appropriate for uptake by cells of *N. tabacum*.



Figure 1. SEM image (a) and size distribution (b) of Ag NPs.

Sepideh Mahjouri, Ali Movafeghi, Baharak Divband, Morteza Kosari-Nasab, Elham Mohajel Kazemi



Figure 2. XRD pattern of Ag NPs.



Figure 3. DLS measurements. Particle size distribution (a) and zeta potential (b) of Ag NPS.

3.2. Effects of Ag NPs on cell viability and growth. Viability assays are one of the essential steps in toxicity investigations that demonstrate the cellular reaction to a toxicant. The influences of Ag NPs on the TTC reductions in tobacco cells are shown in Figure 4, a. A progressive decline in viability observed when cells were treated with Ag NPs after 48 h, which was approximately 95, 19, 11, 2 and 3 % for 5, 10, 15, 20 and 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs, respectively. Actually, TTC assay not only gives information on the cell survival, but also indicates metabolic activities of cells. Hence, it can be concluded that dehydrogenases have either denatured or degraded after exposure of tobacco cells to different concentrations of Ag NPs. In the same way, growth parameters were changed by Ag NPs treatments. The growth was noticeably inhibited at the applied concentrations of Ag NPs (Figure 4 b). In the case of the lowest and the highest concentrations (5 and 25 mg L^{-1}), the final dry weight was 72 and 44 % compared to the control.

Neutral red (NR) is a vital stain and preferentially stored as a protonated form with red color inside the vacuoles of living cells. Accordingly, NR staining was conducted in order to determine the cytotoxic impacts of Ag NPs on tobacco cells. Microscopic observation showed that most control cells had light red color, indicating one large vacuole with low pH (Figure 5 a). Conversely, the cells treated with 10 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs exhibited different stained cells (Figure 5 b). The vacuoles of some cells were heavily stained, while others showed bright red color and even there were cells without color. Furthermore, the treatment with 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs induced cytotoxicity with cells carrying high NR stain and cells with a stained nucleus (Figure 5 c). It could be concluded that lack of NR uptake was owing to loss of cell viability. In addition, high accumulation of NR in the treated cells indicated that the vacuoles were still alive and fight against toxicity of Ag NPs. Actually, transport of toxic metals into the vacuole is one of the ways of reducing the effects of toxic metals in plant cells [36]. Likewise, accumulation of Ag NPs in vacuoles has been previously reported [37].



Figure 4. Effect of Ag NPs on the viability (a) and growth (b) of the tobacco cells.

Programmed cells death was recognized by acridine orange (AO) staining as morphological changes in nuclei of the tobacco cells after exposure to 10 and 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs. A number of nuclear apoptotic bodies enclosing the fragmented DNA were observed in the cells after 48 h exposure to 10 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs indicating early apoptosis in the cells (Figure 5 e, white arrow). However, 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs caused drastic changes in nuclei with intensely fragmented chromatin that confirm late apoptosis in the tobacco cells (Figure 5 f, white arrow), in comparison to the nuclei of control cells that was visualized as regular spherical units

Assessing the toxicity of silver nanoparticles in cell suspension culture of Nicotiana tabacum

(Figure 5 d). In fair agreement with these findings the impact of Ag NPs in induction of genotoxicity is already reported in plant systems [38, 39].

3.3. Antioxidative status of tobacco cells. At the lowest concentration of Ag NPs (5 mg L^{-1}) an increase in H_2O_2 level were observed, but it declined then significantly at 10, 15, 20 and 25 mg L^{-1} of Ag NPs (Figure 6 a). Formation of reactive oxygen species (ROS) is a mechanism, by which heavy metals and NPs cause oxidative damages in plant cells [40, 41]. ROS generation and elevation of H₂O₂ content has been reported in some plant species such as Allium cepa [42]; Vigna radiate [43]; Solanum tuberosum [44]; and Spirodela polyrhiza [45] after exposure to Ag NPs. On the contrary, a significant reduction in H₂O₂ accumulation has been described in Ag NPs-treated Brassica juncea seedlings that is in accordance with our results [46]. Reduction in H_2O_2 concentration in plants under CeO2 NPs stress was reported to be on account of the radical scavenging ability of CeO₂ [47]. As well, Ag NPs are potential catalysts that can act as acceptor and donor of electrons in a redox reaction [48, 49]. However, more assessments are required to shed light on the responsible mechanism for triggering the redox response in plants by Ag NPs.



Figure 5. Light microscopy images of vacuoles after vital staining with NR (a, b, c) and fluorescence microscopy images of nuclei after staining with AO (d, e, f). Several types of NR-stained cells were observed in Ag NPs treated cells: control cells with light red color (a); treated cells by 10 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs with deep red colored and light red colored vacuoles (b); the cells after the exposure to 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs with deep-red colored vacuoles and stained nucleus (c, shown with black arrows). AO staining morphologically showed programmed cells death; nucleus of control cell (d); DNA fragmentation in cells treated by 10 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs (e); late apoptosis with intensely fragmented chromatin in the cells treated by 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag NPs (f).

Analysis of the effect of Ag NPs on lipid peroxidation in tobacco suspension cultures during a growth period of 48 h, showed no significant effect of the increasing concentration of Ag NPs on the MDA content of the cells (Figure 6 b). Indeed, lipid peroxidation is a biological indicator for the ROS mediated damage as it was observed in most Ag NPs toxicity studies in plants [45, 50, 51]. In view of radical scavenging ability of Ag NPs as well as boost in antioxidant enzymes activity, it can be concluded that the reduced levels of H_2O_2 avoided the possible lipid damage affected by the Ag NPs. Our results are in agreement with the previous observations of the influence of CeO₂ NPs on MDA concentrations in *Zea mays* [52].



Figure 6. Generation of hydrogen peroxide (a) and MDA (b) caused by treatment with Ag NPs.

3.4. Activity of antioxidant enzymes. Total protein content as well as SOD and POD activities were assessed in tobacco cells after 48 h of exposure to different concentrations of Ag NPs (0, 5, 10, 15, 20 and 25 mg L⁻¹). Protein content was significantly decreased in cells treated with Ag NPs compared to control (Figure 7 a). Besides, Ag NPs caused a heightening in the activity of SOD and POD as the most important ROS-scavenging enzymes (Figure 7 b, c). A raised activity of SOD was detected in 10 (1.6%), 15 (2.2%), 20 (3.3%), and 25 mg L⁻¹ (4.9%). Correspondingly, 10, 15, 20 and 25 mg L⁻¹ of Ag treatment led to approximately 2, 3, 4 and 5 times higher POD activity.

Similar to our observations, the protein content in different organs of *Spirodela polyrhiza* and *Bacopa monnieri* treated with Ag NPs were lower than the content in control plants [53]. In the same way, treatment of tomato plants with Ag NPs instigated a notable increase in protein degradation, resulting in accumulation of amino acids [54]. As a result, a high concentration of Ag NPs diminished protein biosynthesis or enhanced protein decomposition because of oxidation [45].

Sepideh Mahjouri, Ali Movafeghi, Baharak Divband, Morteza Kosari-Nasab, Elham Mohajel Kazemi



Figure 7. Changes in total protein (a) and the activity of SOD (b) and POD (c) antioxidant enzymes in tobacco cells treated with Ag NPs.

The response of antioxidant enzymes to NPs stress varies noticeably depending on plant species, stage of development, and nature of NPs [55, 56]. Our results showed that both SOD and POD were at their maximum activity levels at 25 mg L⁻¹ of NPs. Recently, changes in antioxidant defense components have been examined as valuable biomarkers in ecotoxicological trials using Ag NPs. Rises in total SOD activity were detected following the exposure of Ricinus communis to Ag NPs [57]. An increased SOD activity in Lycopersicon esculentum plants treated with Ag was also reported [58]. The enhanced activity of SOD and POD indicated that these enzymes were initiated after Ag NP exposure and helped to scavenge the ROS in aquatic plant S. polyrhiza [45]. Elevated levels of POD activity were recorded in B. monnieri subjected to biologically synthesized Ag NPs treatment [53]. These findings confirm the results of gene expression patterns in terms of up-regulation of SOD and POD enzymes [43, 50, 59].

4. CONCLUSIONS

Application of Ag NPs in different industrial and biomedical areas has been gained extensive attention, and thus more awareness about their impact on the environment and living organisms is required for safety assessments and risk management. Accordingly, different plants tolerate environmental stresses by stimulation in the activities of antioxidative enzymes.

3.5. Phenolic and flavonoid contents. The amount of phenols was not affected at the 5 and 10 mg L^{-1} of Ag NPs, but significantly declined in the cells treated with Ag NPs at 15, 20 and 25 mg L⁻¹ compared to the control (Figure 8 a). Furthermore, flavonoid content was reduced after Ag NPs treatments of cells with 10 - 25 mg L⁻¹ for 48 h (Figure 8 b). Beside enzymatic system, plant cells have a nonenzymatic antioxidative defense system against environmental stresses, which mainly composed of phenols and flavonoids [60]. Phenolic compounds can be oxidized by guaiacol type peroxidases for detoxification of H₂O₂, directly scavenge ROS, or act as metal chelators [61]. Remarkably, our results showed significant drop in total phenolic and flavonoid contents in tobacco cells despite the oxidative stress resulting from the exposure to Ag NPs. These findings are in contrary to the reports that showed accumulation of phenols in response to the Ag NPs-mediated oxidative stress [53, 57], but in agreement with reduction in antioxidant activity by increasing magnetic NPs concentration in tobacco BY-2 cells [22]. Likewise, CeO₂ NPs at the concentration of 800 mg kg⁻¹ significantly decreased the phenolic content in cucumber plants [62]. Moreover, the CeO₂ reduced the capacity of antioxidants such as phenols in rice grains [63]. We assume that the reductions in the total phenolic and flavonoid contents point out the antioxidative activity of tobacco cells under Ag NPs stress because they show a protective role by acting as metal chelators and ROS scavengers.



Figure 8. Total content of phenolics (a) and flavonoids (b) in tobacco cells after treatment with Ag NPs.

Ag NPs significantly decreased growth and viability of tobacco cells in all applied concentrations of Ag NPs. Increasing activities of scavenging antioxidant enzymes and lessening content of nonenzymatic antioxidants indicated that Ag NPs induced oxidative stress on tobacco suspension cultures. There are controversial information about the induction of hydrogen peroxide by Ag NPs in different examined plant systems. Reduction in hydrogen peroxide levels by the increasing concentrations of NPs may possibly be owing to the radical scavenging ability of Ag NPs.

5. REFERENCES

[1] Zhang X.F., Liu Z.G., Shen W., Gurunathan S., Silver nanoparticles: synthesis, characterization, properties, applications, and therapeutic approaches, *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 17, 9, 1534, 2016.

[2] Abbasi E., Milani M., Fekri Aval S., Kouhi M., Akbarzadeh A., Tayefi Nasrabadi H., Nikasa P., Joo S.W., Hanifehpour Y., Nejati-Koshki K., Silver nanoparticles: synthesis methods, bio-applications and properties, *Critical Reviews in Microbiology*, 42, 2, 173-180, **2016**.

[3] Nadworny P.L., Wang J., Tredget E.E., Burrell R.E., Antiinflammatory activity of nanocrystalline silver-derived solutions in porcine contact dermatitis, *Journal of Inflammation*, 7, 1, 13, **2010**.

[4] Rai M., Yadav A., Gade A., Silver nanoparticles as a new generation of antimicrobials, *Biotechnology Advances*, 27, 1, 76-83, **2009**.

[5] Prabhu S., Poulose E.K., Silver nanoparticles: mechanism of antimicrobial action, synthesis, medical applications, and toxicity effects, *International Nano Letters*, 2, 1, 32, **2012.**

[6] Rafique M., Sadaf I., Rafique M.S., Tahir M.B., A review on green synthesis of silver nanoparticles and their applications, *Artificial Cells, Nanomedicine, and Biotechnology*, 45, 7, 1272-1291, **2017.**

[7] Stensberg M.C., Wei Q., McLamore E.S., Porterfield D.M., Wei A., Sepúlveda M.S., Toxicological studies on silver nanoparticles: challenges and opportunities in assessment, monitoring and imaging, *Nanomedicine*, 6, 5, 879-898, **2011**.

[8] Cox A., Venkatachalam P., Sahi S., Sharma N., Silver and titanium dioxide nanoparticle toxicity in plants: a review of current research, *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry*, 107, 147-163, **2016**.

[9] Cvjetko P., Zovko M., Štefanić P.P., Biba R., Tkalec M., Domijan A.-M., Vrček I.V., Letofsky-Papst I., Šikić S., Balen B., Phytotoxic effects of silver nanoparticles in tobacco plants, *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 25, 6, 5590–5602, **2018**.

[10] Kumari M., Mukherjee A., Chandrasekaran N., Genotoxicity of silver nanoparticles in *Allium cepa, Science of the Total Environment*, 407, 19, 5243-5246, **2009**.

[11] Yin L., Cheng Y., Espinasse B., Colman B.P., Auffan M., Wiesner M., Rose J., Liu J., Bernhardt E.S., More than the ions: the effects of silver nanoparticles on *Lolium multiflorum, Environmental Science and Technology*, 45, 6, 2360-2367, **2011.**

[12] Mazumdar H., Ahmed G., Phytotoxicity effect of silver nanoparticles on *Oryza sativa, International Journal of ChemTech Research*, 3, 3, 1494-1500, **2011.**

[13] Anjum N.A., Gill S.S., Duarte A.C., Pereira E., Ahmad I., Silver nanoparticles in soil-plant systems, *Journal of Nanoparticle Research*, 15, 9, 1896, **2013.**

[14] Dimkpa C.O., McLean J.E., Martineau N., Britt D.W., Haverkamp R., Anderson A.J., Silver nanoparticles disrupt wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) growth in a sand matrix, *Environmental Science and Technology*, 47, 2, 1082-1090, **2013**.

[15] Vinković T., Novák O., Strnad M., Goessler W., Jurašin D.D., Parađiković N., Vrček I.V., Cytokinin response in pepper plants (*Capsicum annuum* L.) exposed to silver nanoparticles, *Environmental Research*, 156, 10-18, **2017.**

[16] Lee W.-M., Kwak J.I., An Y.-J., Effect of silver nanoparticles in crop plants *Phaseolus radiatus* and *Sorghum bicolor*: media effect on phytotoxicity, *Chemosphere*, 86, 5, 491-499, **2012.**

[17] Babula P., Vodicka O., Adam V., Kummerova M., Havel L., Hosek J., Provaznik I., Skutkova H., Beklova M., Kizek R., Effect of fluoranthene on plant cell model: Tobacco BY-2 suspension culture, *Environmental and Experimental Botany*, 78, 117-126, **2012**.

[18] Islam M.M., Hoque M.A., Okuma E., Banu M.N.A., Shimoishi Y., Nakamura Y., Murata Y., Exogenous proline and glycinebetaine increase antioxidant enzyme activities and confer tolerance to cadmium stress in However, application of diverse plant-based experimental systems makes it difficult to compare the results of toxicity studies. Therefore, comparative studies on Ag NPs in different plant-based experimental systems are essential to clarify this issue in details.

cultured tobacco cells, *Journal of Plant Physiology*, 166, 15, 1587-1597, 2009.

[19] Begum P., Fugetsu B., Induction of cell death by graphene in *Arabidopsis thaliana* (Columbia ecotype) T87 cell suspensions, *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 260, 1032-1041, **2013**.

[20] Mandeh M., Omidi M., Rahaie M., *In vitro* influences of TiO2 nanoparticles on barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.) tissue culture, *Biological Trace Element Research*, 150, 1-3, 376-380, **2012**.

[21] Doran P.M., Application of plant tissue cultures in phytoremediation research: incentives and limitations, *Biotechnology and Bioengineering*, 103, 1, 60-76, **2009**.

[22] Krystofova O., Sochor J., Zitka O., Babula P., Kudrle V., Adam V., Kizek R., Effect of magnetic nanoparticles on tobacco BY-2 cell suspension culture, *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 10, 1, 47-71, **2012**.

[23] Poborilova Z., Opatrilova R., Babula P., Toxicity of aluminium oxide nanoparticles demonstrated using a BY-2 plant cell suspension culture model, *Environmental and Experimental Botany*, 91, 1-11, **2013**.

[24] Liu Q., Zhang X., Zhao Y., Lin J., Shu C., Wang C., Fang X., Fullerene-induced increase of glycosyl residue on living plant cell wall, *Environmental Science and Technology*, 47, 13, 7490-7498, **2013**.

[25] Sobkowiak R., Deckert J., Cadmium-induced changes in growth and cell cycle gene expression in suspension-culture cells of soybean, *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry*, 41, 8, 767-772, **2003**.

[26] Kariya K., Demiral T., Sasaki T., Tsuchiya Y., Turkan I., Sano T., Hasezawa S., Yamamoto Y., A novel mechanism of aluminium-induced cell death involving vacuolar processing enzyme and vacuolar collapse in tobacco cell line BY-2, *Journal of Inorganic Biochemistry*, 128, 196-201, **2013**.

[27] Velikova V., Yordanov I., Edreva A., Oxidative stress and some antioxidant systems in acid rain-treated bean plants: protective role of exogenous polyamines, *Plant Science*, 151, 1, 59-66, **2000**.

[28] Boominathan R., Doran P.M., Ni-induced oxidative stress in roots of the Ni hyperaccumulator, *Alyssum bertolonii, New Phytologist*, 156, 2, 205-215, **2002.**

[29] Winterbourn C.C., McGrath B.M., Carrell R.W., Reactions involving superoxide and normal and unstable haemoglobins, *Biochemical Journal*, 155, 3, 493-502, **1976.**

[30] Chance B., Maehly A., [136] Assay of catalases and peroxidases, *Methods in Enzymology*, 2, 764-775, **1955**.

[31] Bradford M.M., A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding, *Analytical Biochemistry*, 72, 1-2, 248-254, **1976**.

[32] Singleton V.L., Orthofer R., Lamuela-Raventós R.M., [14] Analysis of total phenols and other oxidation substrates and antioxidants by means of folin-ciocalteu reagent, *Methods in Enzymology*, 299, 152-178, **1999.**

[33] Quettier-Deleu C., Gressier B., Vasseur J., Dine T., Brunet C., Luyckx M., Cazin M., Cazin J.-C., Bailleul F., Trotin F., Phenolic compounds and antioxidant activities of buckwheat (*Fagopyrum esculentum* Moench) hulls and flour, *Journal of Ethnopharmacology*, 72, 1, 35-42, **2000**.

[34] Jyoti K., Baunthiyal M., Singh A., Characterization of silver nanoparticles synthesized using *Urtica dioica* Linn. leaves and their synergistic effects with antibiotics, *Journal of Radiation Research and Applied Sciences*, 9, 3, 217-227, **2016.**

[35] Anandalakshmi K., Venugobal J., Ramasamy V., Characterization of silver nanoparticles by green synthesis method using *Pedalium murex* leaf extract and their antibacterial activity, *Applied Nanoscience*, 6, 3, 399-408, **2016**.

[36] Kushwaha A., Rani R., Kumar S., Gautam A., Heavy metal detoxification and tolerance mechanisms in plants: Implications for phytoremediation, *Environmental Reviews*, 24, 1, 39-51, **2015**.

Sepideh Mahjouri, Ali Movafeghi, Baharak Divband, Morteza Kosari-Nasab, Elham Mohajel Kazemi

[37] Schrand A.M., Braydich-Stolle L.K., Schlager J.J., Dai L., Hussain S.M., Can silver nanoparticles be useful as potential biological labels?, *Nanotechnology*, 19, 23, 235104, **2008**.

[38] Ghosh M., Manivannan J., Sinha S., Chakraborty A., Mallick S.K., Bandyopadhyay M., Mukherjee A., *In vitro* and *in vivo* genotoxicity of silver nanoparticles, *Mutation Research/Genetic Toxicology and Environmental Mutagenesis*, 749, 1, 60-69, **2012.**

[39] Sobieh S.S., Kheiralla Z.M.H., Rushdy A.A., Yakob N.A.N., *In vitro* and *in vivo* genotoxicity and molecular response of silver nanoparticles on different biological model systems, *Caryologia*, 69, 2, 147-161, **2016**.

[40] Rico C., Peralta-Videa J., Gardea-Torresdey J., *Nanotechnology and Plant Sciences*, Springer, **2015**.

[41] Zuverza-Mena N., Martínez-Fernández D., Du W., Hernandez-Viezcas J.A., Bonilla-Bird N., López-Moreno M.L., Komárek M., Peralta-Videa J.R., Gardea-Torresdey J.L., Exposure of engineered nanomaterials to plants: Insights into the physiological and biochemical responses-A review, *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry*, 110, 236-264, **2017.**

[42] Panda K.K., Achary V.M.M., Krishnaveni R., Padhi B.K., Sarangi S.N., Sahu S.N., Panda B.B., *In vitro* biosynthesis and genotoxicity bioassay of silver nanoparticles using plants, *Toxicology In Vitro*, 25, 5, 1097-1105, **2011.**

[43] Nair P.M.G., Chung I.M., Physiological and molecular level studies on the toxicity of silver nanoparticles in germinating seedlings of mung bean (*Vigna radiata* L.), *Acta Physiologiae Plantarum*, 37, 1, 1719, 2015.
[44] Homaee M.B., Ehsanpour A.A., Silver nanoparticles and silver ions: Oxidative stress responses and toxicity in potato (*Solanum tuberosum* L) grown *in vitro, Horticulture Environment and Biotechnology*, 57, 6, 544-553, 2016.

[45] Jiang H.S., Qiu X.N., Li G.B., Li W., Yin L.Y., Silver nanoparticles induced accumulation of reactive oxygen species and alteration of antioxidant systems in the aquatic plant *Spirodela polyrhiza*, *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 33, 6, 1398-1405, **2014**.

[46] Sharma P., Bhatt D., Zaidi M., Saradhi P.P., Khanna P., Arora S., Silver nanoparticle-mediated enhancement in growth and antioxidant status of *Brassica juncea*, *Applied Biochemistry and Biotechnology*, 167, 8, 2225-2233, **2012**.

[47] Rico C.M., Hong J., Morales M.I., Zhao L., Barrios A.C., Zhang J.-Y., Peralta-Videa J.R., Gardea-Torresdey J.L., Effect of cerium oxide nanoparticles on rice: a study involving the antioxidant defense system and *in vivo* fluorescence imaging, *Environmental Science and Technology*, 47, 11, 5635-5642, **2013.**

[48] Mallick K., Witcomb M., Scurrell M., Silver nanoparticle catalysed redox reaction: an electron relay effect, *Materials Chemistry and Physics*, 97, 2-3, 283-287, **2006**.

[49] Mukherjee M., Mahapatra A., Catalytic effect of silver nanoparticle on electron transfer reaction: reduction of [Co (NH₃)₅ Cl](NO₃)₂ by iron (II), *Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects*, 350, 1-3, 1-7, **2009**.

[50] Thiruvengadam M., Gurunathan S., Chung I.-M., Physiological, metabolic, and transcriptional effects of biologically-synthesized silver

nanoparticles in turnip (Brassica rapa ssp. rapa L.), Protoplasma, 252, 4, 1031-1046, 2015.

[51] Nair P.M.G., Chung I.M., Physiological and molecular level effects of silver nanoparticles exposure in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) seedlings, *Chemosphere*, 112, 105-113, **2014.**

[52] Zhao L., Peng B., Hernandez-Viezcas J.A., Rico C., Sun Y., Peralta-Videa J.R., Tang X., Niu G., Jin L., Varela-Ramirez A., Stress response and tolerance of *Zea mays* to CeO₂ nanoparticles: cross talk among H_2O_2 , heat shock protein, and lipid peroxidation, *ACS Nano*, 6, 11, 9615-9622, **2012.**

[53] Krishnaraj C., Jagan E., Ramachandran R., Abirami S., Mohan N., Kalaichelvan P., Effect of biologically synthesized silver nanoparticles on *Bacopa monnieri* (Linn.) Wettst. plant growth metabolism, *Process Biochemistry*, 47, 4, 651-658, **2012**.

[54] Mehrian S.K., Heidari R., Rahmani F., Effect of silver nanoparticles on free amino acids content and antioxidant defense system of tomato plants, *Indian Journal of Plant Physiology*, 20, 3, 257-263, **2015**.

[55] Li K.-E., Chang Z.-Y., Shen C.-X., Yao N., Nanotechnology and Plant Sciences, 1 ed, Springer, 2015.

[56] Rizwan M., Ali S., Qayyum M.F., Ok Y.S., Adrees M., Ibrahim M., Zia-ur-Rehman M., Farid M., Abbas F., Effect of metal and metal oxide nanoparticles on growth and physiology of globally important food crops: A critical review, *Journal of Bazardous Materials*, 322, 2-16, **2017**.

[57] Yasur J., Rani P.U., Environmental effects of nanosilver: impact on castor seed germination, seedling growth, and plant physiology, *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 20, 12, 8636-8648, **2013**. [58] Song U., Jun H., Waldman B., Roh J., Kim Y., Yi J., Lee E.J., Functional analyses of nanoparticle toxicity: a comparative study of the effects of TiO₂ and Ag on tomatoes (*Lycopersicon esculentum*), *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 93, 60-67, **2013**.

[59] Kaveh R., Li Y.-S., Ranjbar S., Tehrani R., Brueck C.L., Van Aken B., Changes in *Arabidopsis thaliana* gene expression in response to silver nanoparticles and silver ions, *Environmental Science and Technology*, 47, 18, 10637-10644, **2013**.

[60] Bautista I., Boscaiu M., Lidón A., Llinares J.V., Lull C., Donat M.P., Mayoral O., Vicente O., Environmentally induced changes in antioxidant phenolic compounds levels in wild plants, *Acta Physiologiae Plantarum*, 38, 1, 9, **2016**.

[61] Michalak A., Phenolic compounds and their antioxidant activity in plants growing under heavy metal stress, *Polish Journal of Environmental Studies*, 15, 4, 523-530, **2006.**

[62] Zhao L., Peralta-Videa J.R., Rico C.M., Hernandez-Viezcas J.A., Sun Y., Niu G., Servin A., Nunez J.E., Duarte-Gardea M., Gardea-Torresdey J.L., CeO₂ and ZnO nanoparticles change the nutritional qualities of cucumber (*Cucumis sativus*), *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 62, 13, 2752-2759, **2014**.

[63] Rico C.M., Morales M.I., Barrios A.C., McCreary R., Hong J., Lee W.-Y., Nunez J., Peralta-Videa J.R., Gardea-Torresdey J.L., Effect of cerium oxide nanoparticles on the quality of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) grains, *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 61, 47, 11278-11285, **2013**.

6. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors thank the University of Tabriz (Iran) and the Hayyan Biotechnology Laboratory for scientific and financial supports.

© 2018 by the authors. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).